Chapter Sixteen

RECOMMENDATIONS: COMING FULL CIRCLE

O, give me a home where the buffalo roam,
Where the deer and the antelope play,
Where Seldom is heard a discouraging word,
And the Skies are not cloudy all day
(Brewster Highly, *Home on the Range*, 1873)

Brewster Highly's immortal lyrics could well become a theme song for Wind Cave National Park (hereafter referred to as WCNP), which has long been considered by the Lakotas to be the home of the bison. In Native American traditions, it is stories primarily of bison that give coherency to the area where Wind Cave National Park now stands and to the features of the landscape that make up much of its property. Even though bison were largely extirpated from this area by the 1870s, local tribes continued to think about the general area as the "Stomping Grounds of the Bison Bull," or *Tatanka makalhpaya* in Lakota. When bison were reintroduced to the area in 1913, as a gift from the National Bison Association, and placed under the protection of a game refuge, WCNP became one of only seven places in the United States where bison roamed in a "natural" state. The story of the bison, its origin, history, decline, and reemergence at WCNP provides a powerful cultural focus for the park and a way to bring together the different and at times conflicting histories of the humans who used this area and/or made it their home since pre-historic times.

This year Wind Cave National Park celebrates its one-hundredth anniversary. Anniversaries are times that call for a remembrance of the past. They are opportunities to celebrate and honor former successes and achievements, but they are also moments of reflection to ponder how threads from the past, including undeveloped ones, can move towards new and better visions and forms of representation. Anniversaries are as much about the future as they are about the past. The park's anniversary offers an opportunity to develop a stronger and more inclusive narrative of its history, one that acknowledges the importance of this place to tribal peoples and that includes some of their histories of living here and their cultural knowledge about its landscape, landforms, animals, plants, and minerals. This occasion also opens possibilities for producing new narratives about the park's European American neighbors and their historic relations to the area.

As a way of concluding this report, recommendations are made pursuant to the traditional cultural affiliations that various populations have to the park. The word "tradition" is enveloped in a complex set of meanings, depending on the situation or group to which it is applied. American Indian people, on the one hand, are commonly associated with traditional cultures, which too often connote a way of life existing before extensive contact with European Americans or one that is frozen in time and divorced from the world as it exists today. European Americans, by contrast, are often represented as devoid of traditions or a cultural past that has some bearing on their modern existence. Every community of Americans has traditions, cultural heritages that bring their past into the present. In every culture, these traditions are not static. They are dynamic and vibrant, taking on new expressions and forms in the world in which they are experienced.

The traditional cultural practices of the Cheyennes, Lakotas, and Arapahos, for example, are not the same as they were a century ago any more than European American culture is identical to what it was in the past. Cultures always change, while drawing on a reservoir of traditions that make them unique and distinctive to the people who share and live by them. To say that cultures change is not to imply that contemporary cultural beliefs are any less authentic or true to the traditions from which they come. This holds true for American Indian and European American traditional cultural affiliations to the Black Hills and WCNP.

The authenticity of Lakota attachments to the Black Hills, however, has been challenged in recent years by a number of historians and journalists ill-informed about how cultural traditions recreate themselves over time in new and different ways. Today's traditions may express themselves differently and appear in new contexts, but as argued in the previous section, the beliefs that contemporary Lakotas and Cheyennes hold about the Black Hills are faithful to traditions that stretch back countless generations and that, in some instances, they share with other tribal nations also known to have lived in the area, notably the Arapahos, Arikaras, Kiowas, Plains Apaches, and Poncas.

I. EUROPEAN AMERICAN CULTURAL AFFILIATIONS

Currently, much of the way the park represents itself follows the path of a history focused on European Americans and their presence in and connections to the area. It chronicles the history of European American explorations in and around the Hills, the story of the cave's discovery and development, the establishment of the park's game reserve, the improvements to its facilities during the years of the Civilian Conservation Corps [CCC], and the management of park properties. There are three aspects of local European American history and cultural heritage, however, not well developed in park interpretive material.

A. Local Ranch Culture

First of all, little attention is given to the early history of ranching on the lands that now make up the park and those being proposed as an addition to the park (e.g., the Sanson Ranch). Portions of the park were homesteaded for ranches in the late nineteenth century, and much of the rest of its land was an open range where privately owned cattle and horses freely roamed. There are many interesting lessons that can be taught about the early history of the open range in the Black Hills and the relationship between private-property holdings and public lands. There are significant lessons about the environment of WCNP and the southern Hills more generally, especially the advantages these offered for the small-scale cattle enterprises that laid the foundation of traditional European American ranch culture in Fall River and Custer counties. Interesting stories also exist around the conflicts between local domestic users who historically laid claim to resources on federally managed lands in and around the park and other groups of public users, who desired to preserve them for aesthetic and recreational purposes. Many of these stories certainly encompass the many ways the park has attempted to rehabilitate its landscapes to support the survival of various animals, plants, and minerals for future generations to know and appreciate.

Previous research (Long 1992, Western History Research 1992) on park lands and homesteads offers an important set of data to begin building interpretive programs around the area's early ranch cultures. A more systematic historical effort needs to take place, however, to match the names of some of the park's land patentees with local family histories, published and unpublished. For some families, such as the McAdams, Sansons, and Stablers, their histories can

be reconstructed fairly easily through extant and readily available historical documents. Others, however, will require a more extensive survey of local records and newspapers as well as the collection of oral histories. Since the generation of people who lived on park lands, or whose parents occupied them, are now passing, it is imperative that oral histories get recorded before some of the details of living on these ranches is lost. It would also be important to support historical archaeological research and the excavation of the remains of some of the park's homestead sites. This work could become part of an effort to reconstruct an early homestead in the vicinity of the park's headquarters and to use it to educate the public about this important era in the park's history and the Black Hills more generally.

B. The Culture of Regional Tourism

Second, only limited consideration is given to the culture of tourism in the Black Hills, and the important, indeed pioneering, role that WCNP played in its development. In recent years, tourism as a cultural and historical phenomenon has become a popular subject of academic study. There are many stories to tell of how WCNP developed in tandem with the growth of the spa industry in Hot Springs at the end of the nineteenth century, and how, in later years, it became more closely linked to the national culture of vacationing and sightseeing. The twentieth century forms of leisure travel tied the park to scenic and wildlife attractions farther north on the lands of the Black Hills National Forest and Custer State Park, especially the areas of Harney Peak, Sylvan Lake, the Needles, and the Cathedral Spires. Tourism is a feature of the European American experience that articulates with tribal histories in the area, especially between the years 1920 and 1970, and it is one where WCNP played some role, albeit for a very brief period of time in 1937 and 1938, when it involved local Lakotas in its interpretive programming. It is also one of the few areas where some degree of mutual interest and cooperation evolved between local whites and Indians. Notwithstanding some of the critical commentary on these relationships, especially their exploitative aspects, they do draw attention to one kind of interaction between local whites and Indians not dominated by conflict.

Again, this is an area of the park's history that requires further research. Much of this could easily be put together through materials located in the park's own library, through travel-oriented brochures and books archived in state, county, and city libraries, and through a more thorough search of articles in local newspapers from the Hot *Springs Star*, the *Custer County Chronicle*, and the *Rapid City Journal*, all of which are invaluable sources of information on local tourism. Oral history work would be valuable here as well, particularly interviews with older residents of the region involved in organizations like the Kiwanis Club and the Junior Chamber of Commerce that actively promoted the region's travel, recreational, and leisure assets. Former rangers and staff at the park should also be sought out to share their recollections and vignettes of events happening at the park over the years that reveal how the park's own history evolved in tandem with wider trends in the culture of tourism in the United States.

C. Trails and Travel

Another topic where the histories of European Americans and local tribal nations come together is also related to travel, but at a much earlier point in the history of park lands. Indeed, there are many parallels, albeit of very generalized nature, between the local and long-distance relationships of tribes to the Black Hills in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, and those of European Americans in later times. From 1874 to the present, European Americans have had very different kinds of cultural attachments to the Hills, depending on where they come from, and this is revealed in the contrasting relations of residents and tourists to the area.

The trails that first brought tribes, then European trappers, and later prospectors and settlers into the Hills' interiors are the subject of a rich body of writing. One of these trails, a spur of the Sidney-Deadwood route to Custer, entered the Hills at the Buffalo Gap and crossed park properties along Beaver Creek and some of its tributaries. Members of the Jenney Expedition and forces under General Crooks' forces used this trail. When the gold rush was over in Custer, the trail was no longer a major route for outsiders to access the Hills' interiors, although it continued to play a role in the movement of local residents and their commercial traffic. Another, the Cheyenne-Deadwood trail, came through Red Canyon and followed either Pleasant Valley or Shirttail Canyon as alternate routes to Custer, South Dakota; it skirts the edge of the park's water supply area. After exploring the South Fork of the Cheyenne River, the Black Hills Expedition of 1874 traveled through Shirttail Canyon on their return trip to the expedition's main encampment on French Creek. Two years later, Samuel Hinman's exploratory party may have used this trail too. Today, a modern highway follows portions of the trail. A third major trail, which follows the Red Valley or the Race Track, crosses the northern sections of park property, and today, it is the location for one of the park's major roads. Historically, it was the site of a local wagon route and an area for homesteading. It was also very important to the Lakotas and Cheyennes not only as a thoroughfare and camping area, but also a site of one of their most significant stories about the area and the nature of animal-human relationships.

The use of these trails over time tells a lot about how the history of the Black Hills unfolded until the end of the nineteenth century, and how it evolved in the twentieth century too. The trails illustrate the diverse ways tribal peoples adapted to the Black Hills, and how they used different parts of the Hills on a seasonal basis before European Americans arrived in large numbers. They can also be used to reveal aspects of their twentieth century relationship to the Hills as well. When Lakotas returned to the Hills after 1877 to procure their lodgepoles and to participate in the summer celebrations of local white communities, they arrived by wagon or on horseback. Some traveled portions of the park's old transportation grid to reach destinations in the Hills' interiors, and they also camped here as well.

European Americans used these same trails for many decades. First, the trappers and traders who arrived in the area at the turn of the nineteenth century followed them to reach their trapping sites. Except for Jedediah Smith's brigade, which probably crossed the Black Hills along Beaver Creek and the Race Track, there is little direct information on the presence of these early European Americans at WCNP. There is, however, a richer documentary record for areas immediately to the north in the neighborhood of French, Grace Coolidge and Battle creeks. The trails also reveal stories about later generations of European Americans, the challenges they faced in entering and eventually settling the Hills, including their hostile encounters with Lakotas and Cheyennes, who were trying to defend their own territories and rights of way along these routes. The early history of the Beaver Creek route is associated with a number of interesting events, and even though many of the more notable ones took place outside park properties near Pringle or the Buffalo Gap, they nonetheless reveal one of the roles that park lands played in the history of European American settlement and development in the Hills. Many of these trails continued to be used well into the twentieth century by local white residents to reach their homesteads, fields, pastures, and the lands on which they hunted, collected timber for fuel, and gathered plants for food and medicine.

Some of the Hills' modern highways and access roads still follow the old trail system. Yet, portions of certain trails, including the Race Track and the Sidney-Deadwood spur to Custer, remain undeveloped. The sections of the more important trails that cross park lands should be protected from further development and even possibly listed together on the National Register of

Historic Places as part of an integrated trail system. The trails offer an important avenue to the above ground history of the park, which unfortunately still occupies a subordinate position in comparison with the narratives on its underground spaces. If nothing else, portions of the trails that pass over park properties should be carefully marked and surveyed by archaeologists because of their early importance to both tribal and European American occupation and use of the Hills.

II. TRIBAL TRADITIONS AND CULTURAL AFFILIATIONS

Tribal cultural attachments to WCNP have been downplayed historically in the park's interpretive and promotional material, and these are the ones that are given the greatest attention here, not only because current federal legislation mandates their consideration, but also because these affiliations involve complex and often new areas of interpretation and management for park staff and administrators. The discussion is divided into four sections. The first focuses on identifying the tribal nations with historic affiliations to the park and singling out those that should be included in future consultations. The second gives consideration to specific sites in the park that have special significance to local tribes, along with some of the preservation and management issues that surround them. The second describes the traditional uses to which park properties were put and the kinds of requests that tribes are likely to make to gain access to park lands and resources that fall under the definition of "traditional cultural properties." The fourth topic addresses areas of tribal cultures that might be included in park interpretive programming and the importance of involving local tribal nations in this activity.

A. The Circle of Consulting Nations

For many of the reasons, already enumerated upon, WCNP is not only an historically important area with diverse waves of human habitation from prehistoric to modern times, but it is also a culturally significant one. It represents an area long known as a source of faunal, floral, and mineral provisions, and a place imbued with many important sacred properties. These features alone recommend further consultation with a number of different tribes. The situation is complicated, however, by the fact that park properties sit on contested lands whose ownership continues to be the subject of considerable dispute and will likely remain so into the near future.

There is no hard and fast way to make recommendations on which of the tribes who historically occupied and/or used park lands should be contacted for further consultation. On cultural grounds, for example, the groups requiring consultation are either straightforward and simple, or subtle and complex, depending on the criteria one uses to define the nature of the cultural affiliation. In the broadest sense, the case could be made that any group with a known historically documented occupancy and/or use of the area in historic times is eligible. This could include as many as twenty-four different contemporary tribal nations. If narrower criteria are used in selecting tribes for consultation, the number of tribes included is considerably reduced, but the selection process is more complicated. Although many tribes are reported to have been present in this part of the Black Hills, only a few of them had any long-standing and enduring cultural attachment to the area. Indeed, the only extensive published documentation pertaining to a cultural awareness of and/or a sacred affiliation with park properties refers to the Cheyennes and Lakotas. This is not to say that any of the other tribes did not have, or continue to have, any cultural and/or spiritual ties to the area. It only means that there is no record in the huge body of source material we consulted that gives evidence of such an association. As a result, the possible saliency of other tribal cultural affiliations to the park is much more difficult to gauge. The Arapahos are one tribe, for example, that maintain cultural attachments to the park not addressed in published sources. The Arapahos can be recommended for consultations on other grounds,

notably their historic legal ties to the area, so the lack of any published record of a cultural affiliation should not exclude them. This tribe and others, including the Arikaras and Plains Apaches, whose cultural resource staff claim continuing interests in the park, traveled and stayed in the general region of the park at various points in their history, and they also had close alliances and patterns of intermarriage with the Lakotas and/or Cheyennes who do have important and documented cultural links to the park. Even though the Arikaras and Plains Apaches do not have any legal standing with respect to claims on the Black Hills, at least from the perspective of U.S. treaty making, they still retain memories of the area from earlier historical periods.

Except for the Lakotas and Cheyennes, there is no easy and formulaic way to determine which of the tribes with an historical affiliation to the park area should be included in consultations. In large part, their inclusion in the consultative process is a function of the purposes for which their advice is being sought. If the concerns are related primarily to the contemporary religious use of the area, then the Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos are the primary groups to consult. If the issues revolve around protohistoric archaeological sites that come under NAGPRA guidelines, then Plains Apaches and Arikaras may need to be approached for consultation. If the questions have to do with the history of the area's occupation and use in the late eighteenth century, then the entire roster of tribal nations with known affiliations to the region might be called in for advice.

In addition to the historical and cultural grounds for consulting various tribes, there are also certain legal considerations that need to be addressed. Of prime importance are the treaties that the federal government entered into with various tribal nations, which in one degree or another acknowledged their sovereignty over the Black Hills. Starting with the Fort Laramie Treaty of 1851, the entire Black Hills were recognized by the United States government to be part of the land holdings of the Sioux nation. The Sioux included in this treaty, which incidentally was never ratified by Congress, are the Lakota-speaking divisions: the Oglalas, Sicangus, Itazipcos, Miniconjous, Sihasapas, Hunkpapas, and Oehnonpas, the Dakota divisions of the Yanktons, and through a later addendum to the treaty, the Lower Yanktonnais. When another treaty was negotiated in 1868 to form the Great Sioux Reservation, representatives of the various Lakota divisions, some of the Yanktonnai, and the Santee Dakotas of Nebraska, but not the Yankton, signed it. This treaty also recognized the presence and rights of other friendly tribes who resided in the midst of the Lakotas, namely, the Northern Araphaoes and the Northern Cheyennes. Another treaty in 1868 with the Northern Arapahos and Northern Cheyennes further affirmed their rights to remain on lands that made up the Great Sioux Reservation, which included the Black Hills and WCNP. All of these tribes were also represented by people who entered into the controversial agreement of 1876 that led to the passage of the Black Hills Act in 1877, under which tribal lands in the Black Hills were seized illegally by the United States.

The 1877 Act is at the heart of the legal and political controversies that still engulf the Black Hills and the lands on which WCNP now sits. Whether one takes the position that the legal status of the Hills has been settled or not, it is clear that the federal government has long recognized (at least since 1851) that various tribes of the Sioux Nation have historical entitlements to the Black Hills and that the Northern Cheyennes and Northern Arapahos have historical rights to the area as well by virtue of having jointly occupied the area with the consent of their Sioux friends and relatives. On these grounds alone, the modern day tribes whose ancestors were party to, or covered by, the two 1868 Fort Laramie treaties should be included among the tribes contacted for further consultation.

In recommending the tribes with whom further consultation is required, highest priority is given to tribes with treaty ties as well as substantive historical and cultural connections to the area

of WCNP. In the second tier are groups who do not have affiliations on all three grounds, but, nonetheless, either have strong historic or cultural claims to the area that merit their possible consideration. Any decision to include them among consulting tribes, however, is more contingent and tied to specific cultural or historic issues. The third and fourth tiers include tribes with known historical ties to the area but for whom there are neither treaty ties nor apparent and enduring cultural affiliations to the park area.

1. First Circle

The first circle includes tribal nations whose connections to the area were acknowledged in treaties, who have strong cultural and historical attachments that are documented in the historical and/or ethnographic record, and whose cultural preservation officers have indicated a cultural interest in the park. All of them need to be included among the circle of consulting tribes.

a. The Lakotas

First and foremost among this group is the Oglala Sioux Tribe. Given the proximity of their reservation to the southeastern Hills, this tribe has had the longest continuing cultural relationship to the park in modern times. Most of the stories about Wind Cave or the Race Track come from Lakotas and Cheyennes who are members of this tribe. Two bands identified with the Oglala division, the *Wazazi* and *Oyruxpe*, were known to cover this area in the 1830s. The Oglalas are also the Lakota division with the earliest record of occupancy in the Hills. Leaders from this division of the Sioux Nation were among the first to challenge the legality of the 1877 Agreement and to pursue the case in federal court. In more recent times, members of this tribe have been the most active in staging protests and occupations over tribal treaty rights governing the Black Hills, and they have been at the forefront in trying to bring various land recovery bills before Congress. There is no question that this tribe needs to be consulted not only because they have some of the strongest ties on historical, political, and cultural grounds to the area of WCNP, but also because this is the tribe whose members are among the most likely to look to the park as a place to conduct some of their religious observances. The cultural preservation officer with whom we spoke indicated that the entire area of the park, but especially Wind Cave and the Race Track has traditional cultural significance to the Oglalas.

A second Lakota population that has strong connections to the park represents the Lower Brule and Rosebud Sioux tribes whose members are descendents of the Sicangu (Brule) people. This population also arrived in the vicinity of the Black Hills at an early date, and some of their bands were reported to establish their winter camps in areas within easy reach of what are now park properties. Their leader, Spotted Tail, wanted to have his agency established near the park at the Buffalo Gap in 1874. Luther Standing Bear wrote about his *tiospaye* camping in this area during the same period. Also, a number of the stories about Wind Cave and the area of the Black Hills where it is located come from members of this tribe, especially those who live on the Rosebud Reservation, which was also the location for the settlement of a small number of Cheyennes. Sicangu leaders were parties to the signing of the 1851 and 1868 Fort Laramie Treaties, and they also played a role in future political and legal efforts to reclaim Sioux rights to the Hills. These two tribes also need to be included in the consultative process. Members of the Rosebud Tribe have already participated in archaeological research taking place at the park, and their cultural resource officer is very interested in being involved in all future consultations because of the importance of the area to the tribe in the conduct of some of their religious observances.

Three other tribes, the Standing Rock Sioux Tribe, Cheyenne River Sioux Tribe, and Fort Peck Assiniboin-Sioux Tribe are made up of people descended from the northern or Soane divisions of Lakotas, namely, the Hunkpapas, Sihasapas, Oohenunpas, Minneconjous, and Itazipcos. These divisions were also represented in the signing of the 1851 and 1868 Fort Laramie Treaties, and their modern descendents took part in legal and congressional actions to regain their proprietary interests in the Hills. All of the Soane have strong connections to the Black Hills, but most of the evidence in the historic record and in their own oral traditions associates them with the northern reaches of the Hills. Some of the Minneconjous, however, were reported to have settled near the southeastern Hills during the 1850s and 1860s. All of these Lakotas hold significant cultural knowledge about Wind Cave, the Race Track, and the neighboring Buffalo Gap that has been recorded in historic and ethnographic sources, and therefore, they also need to be included among the consulting tribes. The cultural preservation officers of the Standing Rock, Fort Peck, and Cheyenne River tribes all expressed strong interest in participating in future consultations.

b. The Cheyennes

The Northern Cheyenne Tribe of Montana and the Southern Cheyenne Tribe of Oklahoma need to be included in the inner circle of consulting tribes as well. Northern Cheyenne bands associated with the Masikota, Totoimana, Omisis, Hisiometaneo, and Suhtaio divisions of the tribe are known to have inhabited and/or used the Black Hills from the middle of the eighteenth century until 1877. The Masikota were probably the group of Cheyennes that Francis Parkman placed in the southern Black Hills on his 1849 map. After 1877, segments of the northern divisions of Cheyenne were widely dispersed. Some were settled with the Southern Cheyennes, after their forced removal to Oklahoma in 1878, but others returned north where they were eventually enrolled either among the Oglalas at Pine Ridge and the Sicangus at Rosebud or settled on their own reservation in Montana. The Cheyennes were not explicitly identified with the Black Hills in the 1851 Fort Laramie Treaty, although they were recognized by Sioux leaders, including Red Cloud, and by government agents as part of the "Sioux Nation." They also were not explicitly named in the 1868 Fort Laramie Treaty with the Sioux, but they were included in its provisions as members of "friendly tribes" who had a right to remain on the Great Sioux Reservation, which included the Black Hills and WCNP. Some of their members were also parties to another 1868 treaty at Fort Laramie, in which they were given a choice of joining other Cheyennes in Oklahoma or remaining among the Lakotas. Most of the Northern Cheyennes chose to stay in the north among their Lakota friends and relatives.

The Southern Cheyenne Tribe of Oklahoma is descended mostly from Cheyennes who lived in and around the Black Hills before 1835. The Wotapio division of the tribe lived along the South Fork of the Cheyenne River at the end of the eighteenth century, and other divisions lived at the Forks of the Cheyenne River until the 1820s when they began to move as a group to the Platte River. None of the original body of the Southern Cheyennes, however, was ever a party to treaties and agreements involving the Black Hills and WCNP. After 1878, members of some of the northern division of the Cheyenne nation who were parties to the treaties joined them. In particular, some of the Masikotas who remained in the area of WCNP until the 1870s were eventually enrolled with the Southern Cheyenne Tribe.

The strong cultural attachments of both the northern and southern divisions of the Cheyenne tribe to the Black Hills mostly refer, at least in the published literature, to the areas of Bear Butte and Bear Lodge Butte on the northern edge of the Hills, and these are the places to which the Cheyennes have traveled in the twentieth century from the considerable distances of their modern

communities in Oklahoma and Montana. The Cheyennes, however, have many stories about the Race Track and the Buffalo Gap and the origins of some of their ceremonies are associated with this area. They also retain a spiritual attachment to the thermal waters at Hot Springs, and they were reported to return to this area in the twentieth century. They have sacred stories about a cave in the southern Hills, and even though it is not explicitly identified as Wind Cave, there is a high degree of probability that this is the cave mentioned in one of their Sweet Medicine stories. Although the Cheyennes are not reported in published sources to have taken part in any active religious observances on park properties, the cultural preservation officers of both Cheyenne tribes indicate that they continue to fast and conduct other ceremonies in this area, and one of them also identified the southeastern Black Hills as a location for securing some of the plants used in their religious observances. The evidence in the published literature, combined with the strong continuing interests of the Southern Cheyennes and Northern Cheyennes, recommend that both Cheyenne tribes be included in the inner circle of consulting tribes.

c. The Arapahos

The Northern Arapaho Tribe of Wyoming and the Southern Arapaho Tribe of Oklahoma are descended from peoples who settled territories along the South Fork of the Cheyenne River at locations in close proximity to the Buffalo Gap and WCNP in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. After 1806, most of the Arapaho bands moved to locations on the western side of the Hills. While the Southern Arapahos moved south and eventually ended up on a reservation in Oklahoma, the Northern Arapaho remained in the north. Two of their bands were reported to continue to live and travel at locations on the western side of the Black Hills until 1877. Unlike the Cheyennes, the Arapahos are explicitly named in the 1868 Fort Laramie Treaty with the Sioux and in the Black Hills Act of 1877. Also, many members of the Northern Arapahe Tribe are intermarried with and closely related to people from the Oglala Sioux Tribe. Like the Cheyennes, they have significant cultural ties to the Black Hills, and they consider Bear Butte and Bear Lodge Butte sacred sites. There is no evidence in the historic and ethnographic literature to suggest any strong cultural traditions associated with the area of WCNP. Personal communication and correspondence with Loretta Fowler (2001) and Jeffery Anderson (2001), the two most prominent contemporary ethnographers of Arapaho culture, confirms the absence of specific evidence in the published literature. Both advise that this literature may not be a reliable indicator of extant cultural interests and affiliations, however. Representatives of the culture resource offices of both tribes claimed a cultural interest in the area. There are strong historic grounds for including the Arapahos among the first circle of consulting tribes, and there are also cultural ones that need to be established through further consultations with representatives of the two Arapaho tribes.

d. The Dakotas (Crow Creek and Santee Sioux Tribes)

The Crow Creek Tribe of South Dakota and the Santee Sioux Tribe of Nebraska were also included in the signing of the 1868 Treaty at Fort Laramie, although there is no historic evidence that either of these tribes ever lived in or around the Black Hills. Some members of the Santee Sioux Tribe, however, did accompany the 1874 Black Hills Expedition as scouts. Historically, eastern Dakota peoples, which include the Yanktonnais who are members of the Crow Creek Tribe, lived east of the Missouri River and covered much of the country to the modern day border of Minnesota. The Dakotas who became members of the Santee Sioux Tribe lived in the eastern part of Minnesota along the Mississippi and Minnesota rivers until 1858, when they were settled on a reservation bordering the Minnesota River. After hostilities erupted between the Dakotas and their white neighbors in 1862, some of these Dakota were imprisoned and later moved to

what is now known as the Santee Sioux Reservation in Nebraska. Although both of these tribes claim rights to the Black Hills and WCNP by virtue of having signed the 1868 Fort Laramie Treaty and the 1876 Black Hills Agreement, and although both participated in the claims' case and congressional actions to bring about a return of lands in the Black Hills, their historical connections to the Hills are more recent. The cultural resource officers of the Crow Creek and Santee Sioux tribes, who were party to the 1868 treaty, have expressed an interest in being consulted on Wind Cave National Park. Since these tribes were parties to treaties, agreements, and claims covering the Black Hills, they need to be included with the Lakotas in the first circle.

The cultural preservation officers with whom we spoke recommended different kinds of consultation models, however. Some of the representatives of the different Lakota/Dakota tribes with an interest in park properties suggested meeting as a group since the park is part of the cultural patrimony of the entire Sioux (Lakota/Dakota) Nation. This follows a culturally normative pattern of decision-making among the Lakotas where matters of widespread concern are handled by collectively constituted deliberative bodies. The Arapahos and Cheyennes indicated they are interested in consulting but as separate groups. Since disagreements currently exist over who has "rights" to the area, and since there have been tensions between tribes concerning various Black Hills claims, requests to hold separate and private consultations with the Cheyennes and Arapahos need to be honored and respected.

2. Second Circle

The second circle contains tribes with strong legal, historical, and/or cultural ties to the southeastern Hills, but among whom there are no published cultural traditions specifically tied to the area of WCNP.

a. The Dakotas (Yankton, Spirit Lake, Sisseton, Flandreau, & Minnesota Groups)

Most of the other Dakota tribes, the Spirit Lake Sioux Tribe, Sisseton-Wahpeton Sioux Tribe, the Flandreau Sioux Tribe, the Yankton Sioux Tribe, and the four federally recognized Dakota communities in Minnesota, did not have strong and lasting historical associations with the area of the Black Hills where WCNP is located. Although some of the Yankton/Yanktonnais may have traveled to this area to hunt, and although some of the Sissetons, Wahpetons, Wahpekutes, and Mdewakantons were known to have taken refuge in the Black Hills after the 1862 hostilities in Minnesota, their stay in the area was short-lived, and at best, it constituted a tertiary relationship to the area (see Chapter Seven). Furthermore, there is nothing in the ethnographic literature that suggests any older cultural attachment to the area where WCNP is now located. Present day members of these tribes, however, claim cultural connections based on a pan-Sioux identity and consider the area sacred. Through intermarriages and other close relations, many modern Dakotas have adopted many of the cultural beliefs of their Lakota relatives. The Spirit Lake and the Flandreau cultural resource officers did not indicate any interest, however, in being parties to consultations on WCNP, although individual members of these tribes do have knowledge of the area and consider it sacred. The cultural preservation officer of the Yankton Sioux Tribe deferred to the Oglala Sioux Tribe for advisory responsibilities on matters relating to WCNP. Generally speaking, the interests of these Dakota tribes are not as strong as the Lakotas, Cheyennes, or Arapahos, but they still must be respected because many of their members are descended from the Lakotas and some of the Dakota peoples who had historic ties to the region.

a. The Arikaras

The Arikaras have some of the oldest connections to the southeastern region of the Hills, probably extending back to prehistoric times. In the early historic era, they were known to have taken their bison hunts to the upper reaches of the Cheyenne, Bad, and White rivers in easy reach of the Buffalo Gap and the lands around WCNP. By the beginning of the nineteenth century, for reasons described at length elsewhere in this report, they no longer had easy access to the Black Hills, and by 1851, the Hills were considered enemy territory. The Arikaras have stories of locations in the Black Hills, but nothing about Wind Cave and the area that immediately surrounds it. None of their religious observances appear to be tied to the WCNP area either, nor have any other specific cultural connections been reported in the published literature. The Arikaras were not identified with this region of the Black Hills in treaties and agreements negotiated with the United States, although areas of the far northwestern Hills were considered part of their hunting territory in the Fort Laramie Treaty of 1851. Some of their scouts traveled with the Black Hills Expedition in 1874, and they were an important source of information about tribal beliefs surrounding the Hills. The Arikaras are now members of the Three Affiliated Tribes of the Fort Berthold Reservation in North Dakota, where they live with the Hidatsas and Mandans who also had early connections to the Black Hills but primarily in their northwestern reaches. In fact, the Mandans recently returned to Bear Butte to conduct a Buffalo Dance, according to the cultural preservation officer of the Three Affiliated Tribes. There is little basis for including the Arikaras within the inner circle of consulting tribes, but they certainly need to be consulted in a wider advisory circle especially on matters that come under the guidelines of NAGPRA. The cultural resource officer of the tribe indicated that all three tribes have connections to the Black Hills, and she expressed a strong interest in being involved in future consultations.

3. Third Circle

All of the remaining tribes with known historical connections to the area of WCNP area lived in this region in the eighteenth century and have been removed from it for more than two hundred years. These include the Comanches, Crows, Kiowas, Plains Apaches, and Poncas. The tribes who expressed interest in being involved in consultations are included in this circle, while those who do not wish to be consulted are listed later.

a. Kiowas

The Kiowas lived in the vicinity of WCNP for only a short period of time, from about 1760 to 1790. Although members of this tribe retained memories of their former occupation in this area of the Black Hills, their sacred stories refer primarily to places in the Hills' northern reaches, notably Bear Butte and Bear Lodge Butte. There are no apparent and enduring cultural attachments to the lands that make up WCNP, at least as revealed in the ethnographic sources studied for this report. The tribe's cultural preservation officer indicated that the tribe had important cultural interests in the Hills, but he needed to have more time to consult with his elders to determine whether any of these covered the region of Wind Cave National Park. He requested that the tribe remain on the consulting list until he could confirm whether or not the park had any importance to the tribe.

b. Plains Apaches

Some of the Plains Apaches also retained memories in the late nineteenth century of having lived near the southern Hills, and they also maintained detailed traditions of sacred sites in the

northern Hills, notably Bear Butte and Bear Lodge Butte. Along with the Arikaras, the Apaches have some of the oldest documented ties to the southern Hills. Apache-speaking peoples known as the Padoucas are commonly associated with the archaeological sites that are part of what is known as the Dismal River Complex. The remains of some of these sites, which are now inundated by the Angostura Reservoir, contained tools made from flint that came from Battle Mountain, indicating that these Apaches spent time in areas very close to WCNP. Other Apaches, who became known as the Plains Apaches, were reported in historic sources on the northern and western side of the Hills. They may have absorbed some of the Padoucas into their ranks when this population disappeared as an identifiable population in the late eighteenth century. While none of the Apaches have any on-going cultural connections, which would qualify them as candidates for intensive consultations with WCNP, they do have important cultural traditions about the Hills, including stories about the origin of their *Manitidae* Society, which may have originated somewhere in the southern Hills. They also have the sorts of demonstrable historical affiliations that require meeting with them on matters relating to protohistoric archaeological remains falling under NAGPRA guidelines. Although the Fort Sill Apaches at Lawton, Oklahoma have no interest in participating in any consultations dealing with the park, the Plains Apaches of Anadarko have expressed an interest in doing so because of their historic ties to the area.

c. The Poncas

The Poncas, and at times their close relatives among the Omahas, hunted along the upper reaches of the White River at the southeastern base of the Black Hills from 1740 to 1760. In their oral traditions, they retained memories of the Black Hills, recalled hunting there, and even had a name for Wind Cave, suggesting they had knowledge of it that probably stretches back to the early eighteenth century. There is no apparent evidence in the ethnographic record, however, of any storytelling traditions or religious observances associated with the cave and its immediate environment or the Black Hills more generally. After 1760, the Omahas had little connection to the Hills, although the Poncas retained some limited and episodic contact largely through their occasional alliances with the Sicangu Lakotas, with whom they intermarried in the early nineteenth century. Indeed, the Wazazi Lakotas were of mixed Lakota-Ponca ancestry, and they were closely associated with the southeastern area of the Black Hills in historic times. The Black Hills were not included in any of the treaties that the Poncas negotiated with the United States, nor were they among the lands that this tribe ceded. Today, the Poncas are members of two tribes: The Northern Ponca Tribe of Nebraska and the Southern Ponca Tribe of Oklahoma. Other than an old name for Wind Cave and an historic presence in the region in the eighteenth century, there is no evidence in ethnographic sources for any continuing cultural attachment to the park. The cultural preservation officer of the Northern Ponca indicated that his tribe did not have any current cultural interest in the area, while the officer for the Southern Ponca knew the tribe had historic ties to the area, but is not certain about any further consultation with the park.

4. Outside the Circle

These are tribes with historic connections to the Black Hills and to the region of Wind Cave National Park but who do not have any current cultural interests in the area and who do not want to be involved in consultations.

a. Comanches

Some of the Comanches, perhaps with a few Utes and Shoshones in their ranks, were known to live and travel in reach of the southern Hills in the mid-eighteenth century and to have taken over areas once occupied by the Padouca Apaches. None of these tribes retained memories of this occupation in any of their oral traditions recorded in the published literature. Although the cultural resource officer of the Comanche Tribe of Oklahoma heard that Wind Cave was a location "spirits" frequented, he indicated that only those among his tribe who are descended from or intermarried with Sioux know of this tradition, and that the people at Standing Rock should be the ones involved in consultations with NPS.

b. Crows

The Crows know about the area, but much of their knowledge centers on the battles that took place here with the Lakotas as late as the 1820s. The Lakotas recorded these raids in their winter counts too. Small groups of Crow may have lived along the South Fork of the Cheyenne River in the late eighteenth century amidst bands of Arapaho and Kiowa, but the main body of the tribe occupied areas northwest of the Hills. The cultural resource officer of the Crow Tribe indicated that the park was beyond the boundaries of the geographic area in which they have any continuing and vested cultural interests.

B. The Identification of Culturally Significant Landscapes and Sites

For three tribal populations, the Lakotas, the Cheyennes, and the Arapahos, the area of WCNP is a place with important and enduring cultural meanings. There are two well-documented sites on park properties of sacred significance to one or more of these tribes, the Race Track and Wind Cave.

1. The Race Track

The Race Track is described in the sacred Cheyenne narrative, "The Great Race." In their traditions, the story is associated with the origin of their Sun Dance, *Oxheheom*, and possibly their Animal Dance, *Massaum*. The Lakotas have similar versions of this story in their traditions, and like the Cheyennes, the story recounts an epic event that shaped the fundamental nature of human-animal relationships. The Lakotas also tie the Race Track to a circular constellation, whose stars historically marked tribal travels in and around the Black Hills for subsistence and the conduct of religious observances.

In some Cheyenne and Lakota versions of the Great Race story, the race begins at the Buffalo Gap, a location associated with the origins of other important institutions and with many stories of wondrous events in their histories and in the exploits of some of their culture heroes. The area of the Race Track inside the Buffalo Gap, including the segment that crosses WCNP, is part of what the Lakotas' call *Tatanka makalhpaya,* the "Stomping Grounds of the Bison Bull," and it is an area associated especially with herbal medicines and healing. Today, the Lakotas still come to this area of the Hills to harvest the bearberry or kinnikinick and redosier dogwood for tobacco mixtures used on religious occasions. They also continue to hold a sacred pipe ceremony near this site around the the time of the vernal equinox.

The Race Track is highly significant to both tribes on cultural and religious grounds. Indeed, all locations along the Race Track are considered sacred. The Lakota cultural preservation

officers with whom we spoke singled it out as a site of special importance and one that demands protection. The Cheyenne officers emphasized its cultural significance to their tribes as well, and one of them remarked that even though other parts of the Race Track had been developed, the portion that covers park properties should be protected from any further development. Another recommended that it should be listed on the register of National Historic Places, and we concur (Albers and Kittelson 2002).

Since the arrival of European Americans, the Race Track has been developed, and from a tribal perspective, desecrated. Many portions of the Race Track were transformed in the early years of European American occupation of the Black Hills. Part of the town of Hot Springs and sections of I-90, as examples, were built on this track. Inside the borders of Wind Cave National Park, much of Race Track was homesteaded between the 1880s and 1920s before it was re-conveyed to the federal government and placed under the protection of WCNP. Today, one of the park's unimproved public roads follows the track. Much of the Race Track, however, can still be protected from further development. The lands surrounding it should be maintained as much as possible in some semblance of their "original" state. The area of the park that covers the Race Track is relatively isolated and off the beaten path of the most heavily traveled tourist routes in the Black Hills, and it should remain so in the future. It should also be nominated to the National Historic Register and preserved as part of the original trail system in the Black Hills and as a place where the animals once raced against humans to determine who would be the hunters and the prey.

2. Wind Cave

The second site, Wind Cave, is one of the Lakotas' most sacred sites. It is the subject of several different sacred story cycles, the Four Winds and *Tokahe*, Falling Star, and the Buffalo Wife. The last is also shared with the Cheyennes who tie it, however, to their narrative stories of the origin of the Race Track. In Lakota traditions, Wind Cave is the origin place of the *Pte Oyate*, the bison nation and their human relatives. It is connected to *Tate*, the Wind, and his sons, especially the North Wind, *Waziyata* and his grandfather, *Waziya*, the old man of winter. It is also the domicile of a Buffalo Woman, who appears to hunters and gifts them with bison, and in one story, possibly knowledge of the Sun Dance. There are other stories that associate the cave with additional spiritual figures, including a White Buffalo Bull (*Tatanka*), the Crazy Bull (*Gnaskiyan*), and Little People. Notwithstanding variations in the stories told about the cave and their different implications, all of them imbue the cave with sacred significance, and all of them speak to a wider set of beliefs about the vital relationships between caves, bison, regeneration, the wind, and the breath of life [*ni* or *niya*]. These beliefs are part of long-standing and widely shared cosmological traditions among the Lakotas, some of whose features are also shared with the Cheyennes and Arapahos. The Cheyennes and Arapahos have no particular published stories that can be linked, at least explicitly, to Wind Cave. Nonetheless, like the Lakotas, their cultural traditions equate caves, particularly those in the Black Hills, with the homes of animal spirits. They also view them as sites of emergence and rebirth. Some of the Cheyenne's culture heroes, including Fallen Star and *Mostoyef* or Sweet Medicine, are associated with caves in the southern Hills and the origin of a sweatlodge that brought humans back to life.

Wind Cave is one of many caves located on park properties. While it is the one about which the most has been written, other caves are culturally significant too. Cheyennes believe all caves in the Black Hills hold the spirits of different animal species, and Lakotas take the position that these caves are interconnected and form a labyrinth of passageways that lead to the underworld homes of the *Pte Oyate* and other animal nations. From a Lakota perspective, the entire area

underneath the Hills' limestone formation constitutes the home of the bison and other animals; it is the place where they remain in a spiritualized state before undergoing materialization and appearing on the earth's surface. Any one of the openings to the subterranean world of the Black Hills is considered holy by the Cheyennes and the Lakotas, but the opening at Wind Cave is singled out, at least among the Lakotas, not only because of its strong *ni*, breath-like behavior, but also because of its proximity and connection to the Buffalo Gap, the Race Track, and the thermal waters at Hot Springs. Taken together, these sites form a highly sacred landscape to the Lakotas and the Cheyennes standing at the foundation of some of their most significant religious traditions and teachings.

Nothing appears in the published literature that specifically connects any of the Arapahos' sacred stories with this particular part of the Black Hills. The Arapahos, however, have a number of sacred stories that refer to caves as origin sites for sacred knowledge. In general, they share many of the same beliefs with the Lakotas and Cheyennes about the relationship between caves, animals, rebirth, and the breath of life. Therefore, it would not be surprising to learn from their cultural resource staffs and other spiritually knowledgeable people that they hold similar ideas about this area of the Hills. The same holds true for the Arikaras.

Like the Race Track, the natural opening to Wind Cave and much of the surrounding area in Wind Cave Canyon has also undergone significant development. This area, however, was once a location rich in tipi rings and other archeological remains, many of which, according to Rufus Pilcher, an early park superintendent, were destroyed when the elevator to the cave was built. Some remains may still be present, and this area needs to be carefully surveyed by archaeologists. Surveys also need to be conducted around the openings to other caves in the park with special attention given to identifying cairns and other rock formations frequently used to mark the location of caves with probable spiritual significance in historic and/or prehistoric times. Although stone markers near the opening to Wind Cave are likely to have been destroyed, some of them may remain at locations near more remote cave openings in the park. Further consultations with local tribes also need to be held to determine whether other caves on park properties or other special sites in proximity to the opening of Wind Cave require protection.

3. The Landscape as a Whole

The importance of Wind Cave, the Race Track, the Buffalo Gap, and the Hot Springs is not about these sites as single landforms, separated from each other and isolated from the living world of which they are a part. Instead, their significance resides in their relationships to each other and to the wider universe that constitutes the entire Black Hills along with the animals, plants, and minerals that dwell there. Again, the whole area inside the Hogback, between the Buffalo Gap and Elk Mountain where Wind Cave is nested is sacred. This is an integrated landscape, whose sacredness derives from the relationships between the various living forms that inhabit the area. The Buffalo Gap and Hot Springs are located outside the park, but Wind Cave and part of the Race Track are within park boundaries.

The importance of this area and its landmarks to tribal peoples is often diminished and trivialized in European American writings with terms like "tales" and "legends," implying that the stories associated with them are not to be taken seriously. This represents a serious misreading of the significance of these places and the stories that surround them, all of which speak to fundamental precepts about the workings of the cosmos in Lakota and/or Cheyenne traditions. In tribal perspectives, these landmarks and their associated stellar bearings reveal systematic bodies of knowledge about universal life-giving and life-taking processes, which are

akin to European American notions of "science." The difference between the sciences of Lakotas/Cheyennes and European Americans resides not so much in the elements and processes they describe but in their underlying premises or assumptions about the basic nature of the relationship between spirituality and materiality. In Lakota and Cheyenne perspectives, it is impossible to separate these two dimensions. Consequently, all of the major sacred sites of these tribes attend simultaneously to what European Americans would identify separately as "religion" and "science."

4. Other Possible Sites

At least in reference to what appears in published sources and other publicly accessible material we reviewed for this report, other more specific sites within park boundaries have not been identified in the literature on the historic tribes who occupied the area. One of the cultural resource officers, however, indicated the presence of a painting on a rock above the cave near the top of a mountain (probably, Elk Mountain), where he attended a sweat several years ago. Judging by the discussions we had with various cultural resource officers, all petroglyphs and picotgraphs in this area are sacred and need to be identified, preserved, and protected. Other than this site, no other locations in the park were singled out in the preliminary consultations we conducted. For reasons to be discussed momentarily, this should not imply that other sites do not exist. Indeed, it is highly likely that there are many sites within the boundaries of the park that are considered special but whose whereabouts is considered privileged information.

One of the most likely places for such sites is where springs are located, especially in connection with unusual rock outcroppings and overhangs. Springs, wherever they are situated, are considered "special" places and highly regarded by the Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos (see Chapter Twelve for more details). Cold Springs Creek may be one such area, given the English names associated with some of its neighboring topographic features. Twin Sisters is the name of the local range where the park's water supply is located. In Lakota traditions, this name is a euphemism for the Double-Woman, *Winyan Nunpapika*. A nearby spring off park properties is called Witch Springs, which may derive from an association with this figure, another double-spirit, the Two-Face, *Anog-Ite,* or her mother, *Wakanka*, who is often identified in early texts as a "witch." In Cheyenne traditions, the cave in the southern Hills where Sweet Medicine performed his miraculous feat was the hideout of the Two-Faces. The Double Woman, the Two Face Woman, and *Wakanka* appear in a number of Lakota stories linked to the cave and/or the neighboring Hot Springs, and rock art related to the first figure has been identified at other nearby locations in the Black Hills (Sundstrom, L. 2002).

Springs, bluffs, and rocky outcroppings are also tied to Little People in Lakota and Cheyenne traditions, and in fact, they are identified with these landforms in the traditions of many of the tribes known to have lived in this area of the Black Hills, including the Arapahos, Kiowas, and Poncas. These diminutive figures appear in Lakota stories about Wind Cave and the Hot Springs. They are well known for their capricious behavior, and people need to take special care when moving about the areas they are known to frequent. Offerings and prayers are often made to them. It is highly likely today, and certainly in the past, that springs and rock outcroppings on park properties hold links to Little People. All areas where springs are located on park properties should also be carefully surveyed by tribal consultants and archaeologists not only for evidence of occupation but equally important, for signs of spiritual activity. These areas are important in the culture history of the tribal peoples who occupied the area and also for some of the park's early European American settlers. Of particular interest inside park boundaries are springs located on sections 11 and 14 of T5S R5E that belonged to Margaret Ferguson who formed the Siloam Mineral Springs Company and tried to develop the hot springs on her property in 1904 (Western

History Research 1992: 104). There is also a rich cluster of springs on the southwestern edge of the park, on and off park properties, marked on the old GLO maps.

Another striking topographic feature in the park, identified on an early GLO land map in Section 27 of T5SR6E, is a place called Giant's Thumb, just west of the Race Track. This place name may very well be European American in origin, but if so, it is a curious coincidence, since much of the park area was once associated in Lakota traditions with the old man, *Waziya*, and his grandson, the North Wind, *Waziyata*, both of whom are often described as figures of gigantic stature.

Rankin Ridge is another location of special note. Narrow ridges of this order are often seen as culturally significant in Lakota/Dakota traditions and interpreted as the "backbone" of some spiritual figure or animal (Albers 1966-1976). Its location in the Black Hills corresponds with Lakota star maps and the relative geographic placement of Orion's Belt known as *Tayamni Cankahu* (Backbone), which also make up another constellation in the form of a hand associated with a narrative where Fallen Star recovers the chief's arm (Goodman 1992: 25-27). Although Charlotte Black Elk (1992: 50-51) claims that the stars of Orion's Belt match the three famous prairies Slate, Reynolds, and Gilette in the center of the Hills on the Limestone Plateau, this identification doesn't match the placement of the larger *Tayamani* [Animal] figure where the backbone is situated relative to the Race Track (see Goodman's map 1992: 29). Even if Rankin Ridge is not coordinated with figures on Lakota star maps, it is the kind of landform commonly associated with sacred matters in local tribal traditions.

There are also burial sites in the area, one reported in the valley above the entrance to Wind Cave (Two Dogs in Parlow 1983a:6). Many Lakotas report that the Black Hills are an area people went to die, and a location where some of their ancestors were buried in historic times. Caves, as mentioned in earlier chapters, are portals between the world humans now live in and the world they enter and return from after death, and as result, there are likely to be burial grounds in their general vicinity. In fact, both the Lakotas and Cheyennes once buried their deceased in caves.

Also any areas of the park where certain animals, especially mule deer, bison, eagles, and elk, are known to frequent and feed may draw attention and require special respect, especially if these also coincide with unusual land forms or concentrations of significant plants (e.g., fetid marigold, bearberry, cowparnsip) and minerals, notably gypsum. Some of these areas may not draw attention on a tribal wide basis, but instead hold significance only to certain individuals and families who have spiritual attachments to these places.

Locations other than Wind Cave and the Race Track sacred to modern day Lakotas Cheyennes, and/or Arapahos may not be easy to identify and rank as to their relative importance. Except for the locations associated with religious observances, such as Sun Dances, sweatlodges, and pipe ceremonies, which can be identified because they usually involve groups of people who need to occupy sites for an extended period and build temporary structures for which permits are required from the park service, other sorts of places are not likely to be known. Much religious observance among the Lakotas, Cheyennes, Arapahos, and other tribal nations of the Plains takes place under solitary conditions. There are many different places to which people travel for fasting and other prayerful observances or to acquire plant and mineral material used medicinally and ceremonially. These sites are usually kept secret and are not as easily identified. They are also much more variable and cover a wider range of locations. Typically, these are places where certain individuals and families have special relationships because of dreams, visions, or other spiritual encounters. Some of them may be important but known only to these individuals and their families and/or to certain spiritually knowledgeable people. It is difficult to determine the

importance of such places over others because their significance varies widely from one person, family, or community to another. The specific locations where some of the more solitary fasting and prayerful observances take place are probably not clearly demarcated, and the signs of their use may not be obvious. They may not be associated, as argued in Chapter Twelve, with elaborate and visible offerings such as cloth banners and tobacco ties. Since this is the land of the bison, the offerings are more likely to be unobtrusive and buried in the ground where the bison come from. Yet, for those who use them, they need protection from development and outside traffic. Indeed, one Lakota cultural resource officer was very explicit about the fact that all tobacco ties should be left alone and that visitors to the park should be explicitly instructed not to pick them up. In their informational material, other National Park sites, including Devil's Tower National Monument and Badlands National Monument, advise visitors not to tamper with these offerings. Wind Cave National Park should do so as well.

Again, it must be emphasized that the sanctity of an area is not necessarily correlated with intensive use. Certain places may be avoided out of respect and used only by persons who know how to spiritually approach them. Their whereabouts is kept secret out of respect for the spiritual presence that resides there. Developments of any kind at these sites would be viewed as defiling.

Also for many of the religious observances that Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos practice today, there is not a set place where most of them must be conducted. The location of many of the sweatlodges and pipe ceremonies run by spiritually gifted people may be held in any of variety of locations, depending on the advice a religous practitioner is given in communications with his/her spiritual partners. Similarly, fasting and prayer can take place in many different places. It is critical to understand that there may be many different areas of the park where people have chosen and will choose to make solitary religious observances or conduct group ceremonies. The places people select may be based on tradition or the preferences of the people who serve as their spiritual guides, but they may also be completely novel, inspired by a spiritual revelation to seek out a certain spot to pray and communicate with that which is sacred.

5. Cultural Sensitivities Surrounding Identification of Site Locations

The ways in which the Lakotas and Cheyennes have talked about and conceptualized the Black Hills and their various landscapes, including those located at WCNP, make it difficult to single out a series of discrete sites that can be identified, segregated, and ranked for purposes of cultural protection and management. Where other landscapes exist within the boundaries of the national park, they already possess some degree of protection from further destruction and desecration. While the park service may want other spots to be identified and segregated for purposes of protection and management, this is not always possible or even desirable, especially when the total landscape of the park, or at the very least, a significant portion of it is understood as culturally significant. Park officials need to be mindful of the fact that people may not wish to divulge sacred sites out of fear that unwanted attention will be drawn to them. In my nearly forty years of experience working and living in American Indian communities, one of the things I've heard consistently is that sacred places should be left alone out of respect for the spiritual presence that resides there and people shouldn't "play around" or "mess around" with them unless they know how to approach them properly and with due respect. There is a general sense, not at all unwarranted, that in keeping the locations of these places secret, this will give them the solitude they require and deserve, at the same time, to afford them some degree of protection.

As Suzan Harjo (2002:A3), the highly respected Cheyenne-Creek director of the Morning Star Foundation and frequent columnist in *Indian Country Today* writes:

> Many traditional religious matters cannot be discussed or revealed. Some Native traditional religious matters must remain private and confidential because disclosure would violate the tenets of the religions themselves. Other Native traditional matters must remain private because many Native leaders and practitioners still fear that such disclosures would lead to another federal Indian "civilization" era.
>
> It has been the experience of Native Americans that disclosure about the location, nature or use of sacred places leads to assaults on them. Many of these places are fragile and have been destroyed by too many visitors or vehicles or activities.

With federal agencies, however, a delicate line must be walked because all information is ultimately accessible to the public under various Freedom of Information laws. A recent Executive Order 13007, however, contains a very important provision under Section 1. Part (a) that reads: "Where appropriate, agencies shall maintain the confidentiality of a site." This provides for some confidentiality, but a question that still exists is how does one protect information on sites and locales about which tribal peoples do not wish the public to have general or even specific knowledge? Obviously there are different levels on which this information might be solicited and received in a way that could be used by park staff "on a need to know" basis without making it available to the general public in reports like this one. Knowledge about sacred sites is a trust, and it is not a subject to which many outsiders are made privy, no matter what their ethnic background. Importantly, if these sites are to be identified, it needs to be done in direct consultation with the concerned parties, namely the tribes and the NPS staff, who will be entrusted with stewarding the knowledge of these places and protecting them from desecration and unwanted tourist traffic.

Consultations on these matters are very delicate undertakings. "Fishing expedition" sorts of inquires, including the preliminary consultations for this report, are not likely to be successful in uncovering information on specific sites in need of protection. The identity of additional sites may come to light by asking people "what sites are sacred, and where are these located?" Many more are likely to remain unidentified, however. The danger of this approach is that the results may be interpreted as exhaustive when they are not.

With tribes as large and internally diverse as the Cheyennes and the Lakotas, the two most likely to have cultural attachments to sites other than the Race Track and Wind Cave, there are differences on a family, community, divisional, and even tribal basis. For instance, the Sicangu Lakotas may have a sacred map of the park that is different from the Oglala Lakotas or the Northern Cheyennes. As another example, people from Kyle on Pine Ridge may have different traditions than those from White Clay. To get an adequate sense of all the sites and landscapes deserving special care and respect would be an enormous undertaking, requiring meetings with every district on each Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho reservation. In fact, the importance of certain sites may never come to light until they face development, at which point people may come forward and reveal their location to protect them. This should not be construed as individuals fabricating something to block development for political reasons, but rather as a strategy to keep things secret unless they are threatened and likely to be irreparably harmed. Importantly, park staff need to ask the general questions, but they also need to be cautious about the completeness of any responses they receive to their queries. Whenever the park plans to develop something, such as put in a new trail or campground, tribes need to be brought to the table to look at the locations in order to determine if these are areas to which the tribe in general or specific segments of the tribe have direct interests. Here very specific, <u>onsite</u> consultations are imperative.

The park needs to approach these matters in an open-ended manner, and it needs to develop policies that are broadly based, able to cover the contingent ways in which the Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho people typically identify and approach sites of cultural and even sacred significance. It is important for park staff to have some understanding of the basic practices and tenets associated with the traditions of the tribes who have vested cultural interests in the area. Allowances need to be made for the presence of sacred sites and the observance of spiritual practices in a variety of different areas within park boundaries, not just those that happen to have been identified by accident or revealed in a few published sources or verbal communications. The park needs to adopt a flexible plan in which policy and practice can be adapted to many different contingencies. Having said this, what can the park do in order to acquire some of the information necessary to develop workable guidelines?

As a start, park personnel need to consult directly and on a regular basis with the cultural resource staff of the tribes who have cultural interests in the park to determine the proper way to handle this kind of sensitive information and also to find out the best way to get the most input on sites of significance that individuals who know the area may wish to talk about. Above all, the park should never preemptively close or restrict discussions to certain individuals over others. If the park limits its consultations to people who hold elected or appointed tribal offices, they may not get input from knowledgable individuals not affiliated with tribal government. In general, sacred site identification is a vexatious issue for the managers of public lands and for the tribal peoples who want them protected and need to access them (Carroll 1993:16-21). They are vexatious precisely because of the cultural differences in the ways the two groups approach landscapes and the uses to which they put them (Greiser 1993 9-11; Othole and Anyon 1993:42-45). Tribal people are often not willing to divulge the whereabouts of significant sites because their locations need to be kept secret for any of a variety of cultural reasons. This secrecy makes it hard for administrators to inventory and rank the lands they manage with an eye to their protection and potential uses (Deloria and Stoffle 1998). There is no easy way to bridge this cultural gap, and we offer no facile schemes on how to approach the crossing. In this light, however, a few general recommendations can be made.

One thing we recommend is that the park first develop ways to involve tribes in interpretive programming on less sensitive cultural subjects (described in more detail later). A track record and positive history of dialogue between the park service and the concerned tribes has to happen before anyone is likely to entrust park staff with more specific information on matters of spiritual importance. A relationship of trust has to be developed, and this generally happens when tribes have long-term experience with individuals they know they can trust and rely upon. Unfortunately, this is sometimes difficult to achieve because park service professionals are frequently transferred and unable to remain at a site long enough to develop the kinds of relationships that instill trust and confidence. But even if this takes place and a good working rapport evolves, sites may still not be divulged for many of the reasons just described.

It must be remembered that besides its sacred significance, the area of WCNP has historic importance to the Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos as a location where some of their bands lived and procured a livelihood before 1877, where some of their families traveled and/or camped in the summers until the early decades of the twentieth century, and where some of them fought and still struggle with European Americans and the United States government to maintain their access over a place that is a vital part of their cultural traditions and contemporary identities. Tribal elders from all of these tribes may know locations of historic culture value, including battle sites, camping spots, procurement areas, and trails traveled to reach other destinations in the Hills. Additional inquiries and oral history interviews should be conducted, perhaps in consultation with the culture and language teaching staffs of local tribal and state universities and directed at

learning about historic events and use patterns from times prior to as well as after this area of the Black Hills became a national park.

The park also needs to bring in archaeologists, such as Linea Sundstrom, with demonstrated experience in identifying rock art sites, cairns, alignments, and other physical features in the Black Hills associated with prehistoric spiritual activity. While a survey of this order may well identify cultural properties of importance in earlier times, these may not have any bearing on modern understandings of the area. When they are conducted, they should never be construed as exhaustive of the places where religious observances might have taken place or where they still occur in the present. Nonetheless, all sites of this order inside park properties need to be identified, preserved, and protected as part of the park's rich cultural history.

This report and certainly all others that touch on matters of cultural significance should be shared with the tribes who have expressed an interest in the area, and indeed, most of the cultural officers with whom we spoke and who have any interest in WCNP want to have a copy of this report. In fact, a report such as this one offers a concrete way to open and advance dialogue. It can be used to get clarification on certain issues, correct inaccuracies, and determine which stories and bodies of information can be shared with a wider public in park interpretive programming. In this regard, it must be pointed out that this report is not infallible. It may very well contain errors in some of its representations and interpretations that need to be revised in consultation with culturally knowledgeable tribal advisors. Any research project like this one needs to be viewed as a work in progress. Based as it is on published sources and publicly accessible archival documents, it is only a starting point for a much richer and fuller body of knowledge derived from future consultations with tribes that have strong cultural affiliations to the area.

C. Tribal Access to the Park and Its Resources

Directly related to, and in some case indistinguishable from the issue of identifying sacred sites, is defining the kinds of access that tribal people may want to have to park properties. Over the past thirty years, Wind Cave National Park is an area to which Arapahos, Lakotas, and Cheyennes have come to conduct some of their traditional religious observances and where they have made requests for access to some of its resources.

1. Access for Religious Observances

Over the past thirty years, Lakotas have conducted many religious observances on park properties, including Sun Dances, pipe ceremonies, and sweatlodges. Cheyenne and Arapaho people have participated in some of these observances too or conducted separate and more private ones on park properties. Many of the observances important to contemporary Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho religious practice have specific connections to park properties, as in the origins of the Sun Dance, or through more broadly based associations derived from the more abstract connections of what happens spiritually in sweatlodges and what goes on in caves (see chapters in Section Four).

There is no question that all three of these tribes have legitimate traditional reasons to access the park for the conduct of any of a variety of ceremonies. The issue is where and when can these ceremonies be carried out. Many areas of the park where observances have taken place in the past are isolated, away from the heavily traveled areas around the opening to Wind Cave. Many park locations are not likely to generate serious conflicts of interest among competing user groups because they are rarely accessed. Their isolation may pose other problems for the park and its

staff; for example, they may not be well-suited for some of these observances because they cannot be easily accessed for emergency and sanitation purposes or because they pose fire dangers and other risks. In relation to many of their ceremonial observances, Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos are likely to prefer some of the more solitary areas of the park with limited vehicle access. But there may be occasions when tribes, especially the Lakotas, may request access to some of the more populated areas of the park that do raise concerns about the competing interests of different user groups, paralleling some of the conflicts over access associated with Devil's Tower National Monument (Hanson and Chirinos 1991; Chirinos 1991; Dorst 2000) and Bear Butte State Park (Forbes-Boyte 1996, 1999).

The one area of the park where it will be most difficult to accommodate tribal access is the opening to the cave and the cave itself. Tribal people are (and have been) admitted to the cave through the normal course of group tours. Indeed, school districts from Pine Ridge and Rosebud bring their children here for educational purposes (Terry 1999, Personal Communication), and one cultural resource officer mentioned that the teachers and elders who accompany these field trips talk about the cave's cultural importance to the tribe (Albers and Kittelson 2002). Lakotas and other tribes with an interest in the park do not appear to have been given any special access for the conduct of religious ceremonies inside the cave, although requests have been made in the past for such access. So far, requests to hold ceremonies inside the cave have been raised but not pressed (Terry 1999, Personal Communication).

There are a number of reasons why it is likely that many spiritually-minded Lakotas may not press the issue. On the one hand some Lakotas may believe that areas of the cave now open to tourist traffic have already been desecrated, and as a result, they have been abandoned by the spirits who are now retreating to more inaccessible locations within the vast one-hundred square miles of passageways which form Wind Cave and connect it, as the Lakotas believe, to other cavern formations underneath the Black Hills. Some Lakotas may very well take the position that the publicly accessible parts of the cave have lost their spiritual power, something voiced by Lakota people and recorded in published sources in relation to Harney Peak and Bear Butte. On the other hand some Lakotas may choose to avoid the cave precisely because it is the dwelling place of spirits and because it is "dangerous" to enter their sanctuary without taking respectful precautions, which they may either not know or not be prepared to undertake.

There is also the fact that no mention has been made in the published literature of ceremonies being conducted inside of caves, other than references to people being transported into the interiors of caves in dreams and visions. Even when people are reported to have used caves as places to fast and pray, it is not always clear whether they entered cave interiors or conducted their observances near their openings. The one reference (Stabler in Bohi 1962) to Lakotas touring the cave in the 1890s clearly describes their reverential and prayerful attitude towards this place. It is more likely that requests will continue to be made in the future for the use of surface locations where the cave is nested. Any of the more remote places in and around Elk Mountain where the cave is situated might be used for ceremonial purposes, and in fact, they have been so used in the past according to the culture resource officers of some Lakota tribes. Given native understandings of the interconnectedness of all caves in the Hills, it is also probable that requests will be made for the conduct of religious observances at some of the cave openings in more remote areas of park properties.

The park could be still pressed in the future to open the interiors of Wind Cave for religious observances outside the tour schedule. One culture resource officer indicated that some Lakota people would like to enter the cave privately to hear what the spirits are saying and to identify the language they are speaking. Requests may very well be made for the conduct of prayerful

observances that require the smoking of a pipe or smudging with cedar, sage, and/or sweegrass. Such access would certainly require some accommodation on the part of WCNP staff. The question park managers need to ask themselves: Is this activity any more intrusive than allowing a group of recreational spelunkers to explore the cave with their carbide lamps, ropes, knee pads, and other devices which permit them to safely navigate the cave's underground passageways? The use is clearly different, but what needs to be weighed objectively is whether the impact on the cave and its fragile boxwork formations is qualitatively different. As a former spelunker, I would maintain that allowances could be made, in the short-term and long-run, for small Lakota, Cheyenne, and/or Arapaho groups to make prayerful observances privately because this activity is much less invasive than the throngs of tourists who wind their way through the cave everyday and no more intrusive than the activity of most spelunkers.

2. Access to Resources Used in Traditional Cultural Practices

Beyond the need for some Lakotas and Cheyennes to use the park to conduct their religious observances, requests have been made and are likely to be made in the future for securing herbs, soils, stones, and other resources for healing and ceremonial purposes (Terry 1999, Personal Communication). In this regard, the park has special importance because of Lakota and Cheyenne beliefs about the underground world as the home of the bison, an animal also connected to a variety of plants and minerals used in their healing and ceremonial traditions. Although discussed in some detail in previous chapters, the point needs to be made again that natural resources found on park properties are significant not because they are rare and don't appear elsewhere, but because of the overall sacred character of the landscape where they are located. The animals, plants, soils, and stones associated with the places where humans and bison emerged to populate the earth's surface or where they raced to determine the nature of their relationship are likely to be seen as especially sacred and potent.

Some of the plants found on park properties that Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos might request for use in traditional cultural contexts are discussed extensively in Chapter Eleven and in Appendix B, and this does not bear repeating here. Most of the Cheyenne and Lakota culture officers with whom we spoke associated the park with plants. Most of the plants that tribes require for traditional cultural purposes would not be threatened because they do not require any sort of intensive harvesting. A few tribal culture preservation officers singled out two of the plants important in the park, sage and kinnikinick, but most spoke about the area's plants in general terms. One officer also mentioned that visitors to the park should be advised not to pick the sage in the area because of its sacred significance (Albers and Kittelson 2002).

Soils used in building ceremonial altars, especially those brought to the surface of the earth through the actions of prairie dogs, voles, badgers, ants, and other burrowing animals, are believed to hold the purifying properties of the deep earth. Although none of the cultural resource officers with whom we spoke mentioned the soils, Lakotas have requested them from park staff in the past (Terry 1999, Personal Communication). As discussed in considerable length elsewhere (see Chapter Nine for further details), these soils are considered sacred and especially so because they come from ground that is the home of the bison. Such requests are certainly consistent with Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho historic and modern religious practice.

There are a number of stones and minerals found on park properties that are associated with traditional cultural functions. As described in greater depth in Chapter Eleven and Appendix C, one of these is gypsum. While the tribal cultural preservation officers with whom we spoke made no specific mention about the area in relation to minerals, there is one reference (Pilcher

1964) to the Lakotas making a request for stones in the past. Requests of this order also follow long-standing traditional cultural uses. Gypsum is essential to the conduct of many important religious ceremonies, and even though it can be found at many locations outside WCNP, the local outcroppings may have special importance because, once again, they come from the home of the bison or appear along the Race Track. Indeed, the very origin of gypsum deposits found along the Race Track is revealed in one of the Cheyenne stories about the Great Race (see Chapter Fifteen).

Nor did any of the tribal resource officers single out the park as a source of animal parts for traditional cultural purposes. Bison skulls, bladders, and other parts have been requested for these purposes in the past (Terry 1999, Personal Communication). Once again, these requests are perfectly appropriate and tied to traditional cultural ideas not only connected to particular animals (see Chapter Ten and Appendix A) but also linked to the park and its general environs. Indeed, with congressional approval, WCNP supplied local tribes with bison and other game meat for several decades. The park is closely associated with animal origins. Wind Cave is the home of the *Pte Oyate*, Buffalo Nation, in Lakota traditions. It is also integrally related to the establishment of the prevailing order of relations between animals and humans as revealed in the story of the Great Race that took place along the Race Track. It is also probably related to the Falling Star cycle, whose stories happen at locations in and around the Hills in both Lakota and Cheyenne traditions.

The scope, identities, and/or whereabouts of the plants, soils, minerals, and animal parts that Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos may need to access from park properties for traditional cultural uses requires further and more direct consultation. What needs to be determined through such consultation is whether there are any specific areas of the park where people need to collect plants, soils, and stones for traditional cultural purposes. As in the case of sacred sites, additional details on this subject may not be forthcoming because of the secretive nature of the information or the fear that once a location is divulged access to it will be prohibited. Here as well, WCNP staff need to devise an open-ended approach, one that takes into consideration the private and contingent nature of traditional utilization patterns associated with many of the plants, minerals, and soils found on park properties. Also, it bears repeating that significant individual, family, community, and tribal differences probably exist in identifying the location, nature, and significance of "natural" resources associated with traditional cultural uses. Once more, there is no simple or formulaic way to single out and rank these resources for purposes of protection and use.

D. Tribal Perspectives in Park Interpretive Programming

As mentioned before, the park could go a long way in establishing positive relationships with local tribes by involving them in the production of narratives for the park's interpretive programs and literature. The park sits on lands that have had considerable cultural significance to the Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos for many generations. The tribal side of the park's natural and cultural history has remained conspicuously absent in various educational venues, and this ought to be changed.

In response to the issue of whether the park should include a tribal perspective, we have heard two sorts of informal responses on the matter. One, a minority view, is the park has no business involving itself in matters of cultural importance to local tribes. In the second perspective, representing the vast majority, people are disturbed that the park has not incorporated anything specific about local tribes in its literature and programs. Some are offended by the failure of the

park to acknowledge the rich tribal history associated with the region and especially the suggestion that Wind Cave was first "discovered" by European Americans. In more formal consultations, all of the cultural officers with whom we spoke believed the park should include tribal perspectives in its interpretive venues. The issue is not whether any attention should be given to tribal perspectives, but rather, what kinds of information can be legitimately included and who has the right to convey it. All of the cultural officers indicated that there were areas of cultural knowledge that could become part of the park's interpretive programming and some even suggested that certain traditional stories about the area could be told as well, but only by people from the tribes where the stories originated. All were equally emphatic that certain kinds of information about beliefs and practices surrounding spiritual observances and ceremonies should not be included. Some also indicated that certain sacred narratives about the area and its land-forms should not be shared with the public. This is an area where it is absolutely imperative for direct communication to take place between park staff and tribal cultural resource officers. Further and direct consultations need to take place around what aspects of traditional cultural belief and practice can become part of the park's interpretive programming.

There are many cultural subjects relating to the park that offer valuable teachings without crossing the line into highly sensitive and sacred cultural material. As reveled elsewhere in this report (Section Three and Appendices A-C), there is a vast wealth of published cultural information on the animals, plants, and minerals found on park properties and some of the practical aspects of their utilization. In consultation with local tribes, it is possible to do culturally sensitive programming of the kind that took place at Glacier National Park with the Piegan Institute, where common plants and their uses were identified along one important park trail. The development of educational material that incorporates tribal perspectives could be focused geographically or topically.

As discussed earlier, some of WCNP's historic trails along Beaver and Cold Spring creeks might serve as a focus for telling stories of historical events that happened along their routes at different points in time, for describing the different groups of peoples who used them and their modes of adaptation to the area, and finally, for identifying some of the natural resources they would have encountered along the route at different points in time. For example, the trails could be used as a vehicle for talking about the history of certain plants and animals from different cultural perspectives. Native plants, such as chokecherry and wild mint, might be identified and described from a European American botanical perspective and then discussed in terms of how they are named and understood in tribal botanies. Their common and utilitarian uses for both groups could be discussed in both historic and modern contexts. Information about when certain native plants became abundant in the area, when others disappeared, and when new plants, such as mullein, arrived could lead to fascinating stories about wider human-environmental adaptations to the region. Currently, there are a number of programs at local educational institutions, including Red Cloud High School, Sinte Gleska University, and the American Indian Studies program at Black Hills State College, where work is being conducted on identifying the native names and uses of plants in the region. The park could certainly work cooperatively with one or more of these institutions to develop interesting interpretive materials from a tribal perspective.

In devising interpretive programming around some of the park's trail systems, it is imperative that the park not follow rhetorical structures where history begins with Indians and ends with whites. A persisting problem with the literature on the cultural history of the Black Hills is that it treats tribal traditions as relics from the past, not as vital and continuing bodies of knowledge. Every stage of history in the park's development, both before and after it was established in 1903, should include a discussion of tribal affiliations and connections. To be sure, tribal relationships are different today than in former times but so are those of the region's European Americans.

Above all, tribal connections to the park should not be sequestered and treated apart from the overall picture of the park's history, nor should they be diminished and trivialized in the kinds of narrative structures which privilege European American perspectives.[1]

Interpretive programs might also be focused on some of the animals that make up the park's landscape. In this regard, the natural and most significant focus for American Indians and European Americans is the bison. After all, this is the bison's home, their stomping grounds, and the place where they first returned after being extirpated from the area in the 1880s. So much of the park's identity in tribal traditions is connected to the bison, and in European American traditions, it remains a focus as well. Even in the years when cattle took over much of their traditional range, the bison were still present in the memories and stories of the people who once lived and traveled in the area and in the place names given to local landforms. How bison were historically taken in this area, how they were used, and also how they are thought of in traditional and contemporary belief systems are important subjects for the park's cultural programming. These topics could be presented in conjunction with the presentation of materials on the wider history of bison in the Black Hills region, their changing place in the lives of the tribal peoples who originally settled this land and in the lives of the European Americans who came to settle the area in later years. There is a rich published literature on this subject. Much of what is written about the bison from a tribal perspective is based on the words of Lakotas and Cheyennes. The information is part of a public record that people, such as Luther Standing Bear, Nicholas Black Elk, John Stands in Timber, and Wesley Whiteman, wanted to be preserved and shared. Today, there are many tribal people among the Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho nations who are knowledgeable about this subject and who could serve as advisors in developing innovative and culturally sensitive interpretive materials. It has already been done at a provincial park in southern Alberta, called, Head Smashed In Buffalo Jump. This World Heritage Site, which received international awards and acclaim, represents a joint effort between the provincial government of Alberta and the Blackfeet tribe, and it serves as a model for how an area can become a focus for conveying cultural and historic information in a setting where Indians and non-Indians cooperatively participate in its production.

Other animals, from mule deer and elk to snowbirds and prairie dogs, might also be a focus for developing collaborative cultural materials. There are many plants, including wild turnip, box elder, ponderosa pine, the purple coneflower, and even sage, that might be described in collaborative ways without crossing sensitive cultural boundaries. The same holds true with certain minerals from flint and gypsum to sandstone and limestone. Whatever natural resources are selected for developing interpretive material, input from tribal cultural resource officers, educators at local tribal and state colleges, and knowledgeable tribal elders and spiritual leaders is necessary to determine what subjects and content are appropriate to share in public settings. Since it is hard sometimes to talk about tribal relationships with the natural world without touching upon spiritual issues, it is necessary to bring tribal people into the consultative process to determine where the lines need to be drawn. The very understanding of bison, for example, where they come from, and what they mean takes one into the realm of sacred knowledge and understanding in tribal perspectives. Since aspects of most knowledge about animals, plants, and minerals inevitably touch on sacred issues, it is imperative to get advice from local tribes on the cultural protocols here.

[1] Te Papa, the National Museum of New Zealand has done an excellent job of telling the natural and cultural histories of New Zealand from the two very different perspectives of the indigenous Maori tribes and the incoming Europeans [*Pakahana*].

The focus, or if one will the handle, for cultural programming might include specific landforms. Even highly sacred places, such as the Race Track and Wind Cave, are the subject of stories that have become part of the public record. Some aspects of these stories might be told. Certainly, Henry Black Elk and James La Pointe wanted their stories about Wind Cave known and told to the children. They were published in sources sponsored and supported by tribal educational institutions Sinte Gleska University and the Indian Historical Press, respectively, and so are many other stories about the cave and the Race Track. Here, the issue is not so much whether their versions or any other stories should be told, but who should do the telling. Two tribal cultural preservation officers were very emphatic that stories of this kind need to be told by members of the tribes who consider them part of their cultural patrimony. There is a thin line here, not only with respect to a tribe's intellectual property rights but also in relation to the appropriateness of telling certain stories even when these have been published. Again, the tribes need to be consulted on what stories can be told, who can be entrusted with their telling, and how they should be framed.

It is also important to remember that there are many different stories and versions of the same narratives about these places. There is not, as discussed earlier, any single or "right" story about either Wind Cave or the Race Track. This diversity needs to be acknowledged and respected, and the visiting public needs to be made aware of this fact. Even if tribes do not wish to give their consent to having specific stories told about Wind Cave and the Race Track, there might be respectful ways the park service can allude to the fact that tribes hold important bodies of knowledge about these landforms. It might be possible, for instance, to talk about how the Cheyennes and Lakotas see caves as the spiritual homes of animals and the places where they come to the earth's surface to undergo their materialization. Or, it might be appropriate, as another example, to alert park visitors to the fact that the park sits on land that is spiritually important to local tribes and that if they come across tobacco ties and other evidence of spiritual activity these should be left alone.

Above all, one thing that needs to be corrected is the false idea that local tribes lacked a sophisticated understanding of their environments. Tribal ideas about the Black Hills, their geological activity, astronomical phenomena, plant habitats, and animal life deserve to be treated with respect as different, but no less compelling ways of thinking about the workings of the universe. The Black Hills' incredible natural diversity and their position as a confluence for all kinds of different life forms is well recognized in the knowledge banks of local tribes. The Black Hills are a powerful teacher in this regard, as the Lakotas and Cheyennes have long known, and it would behoove the park service to incorporate, where it is culturally appropriate and permissible to do so, some of the important teachings about the Hills and the area of Wind Cave National Park that come from the writings and oral traditions of the tribes familiar with this place.

Directly following, another thing in need of clarification is the misleading impression that local tribes lacked any knowledge of Wind Cave before European Americans arrived. It is hard to imagine how the cave's presence would have gone undetected by peoples as intimately familiar with the region for hundreds of years as the Cheyennes, Lakotas, and Arapahos. It is a bit disingenuous to attribute the cave's "discovery" to Jesse and Tom Bingham. Although the Binghams may have been the first European Americans to spot the cave, there can be no doubt that local tribes knew of its existence well before European Americans ever ventured into this area.

III. CONCLUSIONS

Part of developing sound management policies and making decisions about the park's traditional cultural properties requires fostering and maintaining good collegial relations with the local populations whose own histories and traditions are represented in these resources. In the same way that parks are expected to maintain respectful ties with their European American neighbors and their state and local governments, so parks should approach local tribal people and their tribal governments in the same way. Politeness and good common sense can go a long way in building positive relationships where matters of common interest can be approached in mutually respectful and acceptable ways. Even though the terms of tribal interest and access to the park are likely to be substantially different from those of European Americans, these should be handled through the same kind of open dialogue typically associated with other impact and access issues.

In brief review, there are four major areas to which the park needs to direct its attention in regards to traditional cultural properties.

>1) First, it needs to acknowledge and respect the rich body of culture history and tradition that surrounds this place. There needs to be some level of recognition in park literature and programming of the importance of this region to the Lakotas, Arapahos, and Cheyennes, and the place it occupied earlier, and perhaps contemporaneously, for other tribes, including the Arikaras, Comanches, Poncas, Kiowas, and Plains Apaches. Minimally, the park should at least acknowledge the occupancy and probable use of its lands by these tribes, the kinds of adaptations they might have made to the area, and the importance of this in relation to the habits and habitats of the animals and other life forms located here. Ideally, the telling of this history and its associated traditions would take place from the viewpoints and perspectives of the people who were here over the last two centuries, which includes the Lakotas, Cheyennes, and Arapahos. It would also include various groups of European Americans, especially those who occupied and made a living from the lands of Wind Cave National Park, but their story should be placed in perspective. It needs to complement, not dominate, the history of the area where the park is situated.

>2) Second, the park needs to work directly with tribal culture preservation officers to determine where additional but more solitary sacred sites might be located for fasting and other prayerful observances and to determine how these places need to be protected. In addition, it needs to find out how some of the more culturally sensitive information about these places might be respectfully collected and protected by park staff.

>3) Allowances and considerations regarding requests for the use of park properties for ceremonial observances need to be guided by flexible and open-ended management policies, ones that are informed by and respond to the diverse ways different tribes approach their religious observances. Sun Dances, sweatlodges, pipe ceremonies, fasting, and a host of solitary prayerful observances are all consistent with the sacred character of park properties. In all respects, permission to carry on religious observances in the park's subterranean and surface spaces needs to be judged in terms of their potential impacts on the landscape and its resources, not because they represent styles of access different from those customarily undertaken by European Americans.

>4) Allowances and considerations might also be made for access to plants, soils, minerals, and animal parts used in traditional cultural contexts. Although this report has listed and

described many of these in Section Four and in Appendices A, B, and C, the coverage is by no means exhaustive or complete. Most of the traditional cultural resources that tribal people require from this area are important because of their association, at least in Lakota traditions, with the lands on which the bison originate. The fact that this land is their home and stomping grounds is very significant in relation to a host of traditional practices still carried on in Lakota, Cheyenne, and Arapaho communities.

In order to develop a sensible policy, direct consultations need to take place with all interested tribal parties. The way in which the consultation is structured may vary from one tribe to another, according to local cultural norms and the preferences of the tribes' culture preservation officers. As stated in Executive Order 13084, signed in May of 1998, all federal agencies are directed to work with tribes on a government-to-government basis to collaborate and consult on the formulation of federal regulatory policies and practices affecting tribal interests. Two years earlier, Executive Order 13007 was signed into law, directing federal agencies to provide accommodations to protect sacred sites and permit access to and uses of these sites by religious practitioners from federally-recognized tribes.[2] Along with other legislation, including Public Laws 96-95 [ARPA], 101-601 [NAGPRA], 95-341 (ARFA), and the National Historic Preservation Act, there is now a body of laws and regulations requiring federal agencies to protect traditional cultural, historic, and/or sacred properties of interest to American Indian tribes and to afford these tribes' access to and use of them. As we interpret these statutes and directives, the park must arrange its consultations through tribal governments, especially the cultural preservation offices that are delegated to deal with such matters.

In many cases, the park will need to solicit advice beyond the offices of tribal government and call on tribal educators and religious practitioners for information and direction. Above all, the park service should not rely on lone advisors and consultants. Wind Cave and the Race Track remain an important part of the cultural patrimony of all the Lakotas and Cheyennes. Individual members of these two tribes may be uncomfortable speaking on behalf of, much less offering advice on, matters that affect their entire nation. Whenever one is dealing with a cultural issue that affects an entire tribe, it is imperative that people representing the widest range of cultural interests come to the table to confer on an issue. What must not be done is to choose or identify specific people as "final" arbitrators and authorities on what is or is not significant about the park's sites and landscapes. While there are certainly tribal people who know more about the area than others, and while there are those who are more qualified than others to talk about its spiritual standing, no one can speak for the entire Oglala tribe, much less the entire Lakota or Cheyenne nation. Because as soon as one person is identified as an "expert," there are hundreds of others who will invalidate their view and disclaim any association with it. This is not to imply that any one consultant's advice should not be taken seriously, but, rather, that there is a need to respect the fact that there are multiple perspectives. There are many different stories, sites, resources, and modes of access that define tribal affiliations with this area. At all times, this diversity must be acknowledged and respected.

It is also important to remember that most everything about the Black Hills is highly politicized. This makes consultation and consensus on various cultural matters all the more difficult. WCNP is contested land. It is part of the long-standing and from a Sioux perspective, still unresolved claims. It is also part of an area to which the Cheyennes and Arapahos lay claim.

[2] The expression "federally-recognized tribe" refers to a tribe that through treaty, executive order, or congressional agreement, has an established relationship with the federal government. As this applies in Executive Order 13007, only persons who are members of such tribes are in a position to consult on matters governing the protection of sacred sites on federal properties and to access and make use of them.

Although neither of these latter tribes was ever able to press their claims in federal court, they still have strong historical entitlements to this area. Notwithstanding the close ties of friendship and kinship that otherwise connect them, the inability of the Cheyenne and Arapaho to come together with the Lakotas in a united effort to reclaim the Hills has created some degree of resentment. All three of these tribes need to be included in consultations, and the Cheyennes, in particular, need to be involved in any decisions about areas of the park that cover the Race Track. On religious grounds and in terms of more general, traditional cultural affiliations, the Cheyennes have a significant cultural stake in this area. Although Cheyenne and Arapaho communities are located at some distance from WCNP, a fact that has clearly influenced the frequency and intensity of their visits to the park, they are still vital players in cultural consultations. Given some of the tensions that surround each of these tribe's relationship to the Black Hills, each should be consulted separately, not as a mechanism for creating further divisiveness but out of respect for their differing cultural interests in the park.

Even among the tribes who make up the Sioux Nation, at least for the purposes of the Black Hills claims, there are going to be disagreements over who has the most legitimate right to speak on behalf of cultural interests pertaining to the park. Since all of these tribes are interrelated through close-knit webs of kinship and friendship, it is hard to say which ones stand in a more or less privileged relationship regarding their cultural concerns for the park. While it is true that the Oglala Sioux Tribe is the closest geographically and the one whose members probably have more occasion to visit the park, the Rosebud, Lower Brule, Cheyenne River, Fort Peck, and Standing Rock Sioux tribes also have vital interests and strong cultural traditions that are tied to this area of the Hills. In the case of the Sioux, as noted previously, many of the cultural preservation officers indicated a preference for consulting with park staff as a group. An advisory group made up of cultural preservation officers, Lakota language and culture instructors from tribal institutions of higher education (i.e., Sinte Gleska University), culturally knowledgeable tribal elders, and religious leaders from each of the tribes could offer a powerful and positive collective voice on matters of mutual interest to the park and the Lakota people. Organizing consultations in this manner not only insures wide representation, but it also avoids any appearance of preferential treatment.

However the consultations are organized, it is clear that all three tribes need to be represented when it comes to developing interpretive programming that incorporates tribal perspectives. All of them need to be featured in the stories that are told about the park's history over the past two-hundred years. Their perspectives need to be included in the narratives about the park's various life forms, their interests need to be considered relative to the location and protection of sacred sites, and their concerns need to be heard regarding access to the park for the conduct of religious observances and access to other traditional cultural properties necessary for the continuance of important cultural practices and beliefs.

It is also recommended that the park service develop venues where park service staff and researchers engaged in archaeological and ethnographic studies of neighboring parks have an opportunity to meet, share, and discuss issues of mutual interest. Since research conducted at Devil's Tower National Monument, Badlands National Park, Scotts Bluff National Monument, and Agate Fossil Bed National Monument involve many of the same tribes whose histories and relationships to these areas intersect, there should be some opportunity to discuss possible directions for achieving consistency in the management policies surrounding sacred sites, traditional cultural properties, and interpretive programming. Indeed, at some point in the future, it might be a good idea to create a special position for a cultural liaison to work with tribes in forming advisory bodies and in consulting on matters that pertain to all of them.

Notwithstanding the strong legal and moral claims that certain tribes hold to the area that makes up WCNP, it is not likely that park properties are going to be relinquished to the Lakotas or any other tribe in the near or foreseeable future. This does not mean that tribal concerns should be dismissed. It is no longer possible, given current federal policy and law, not to attend to these concerns. Even without these mandates, the tribal presence and relationship to the park is simply too compelling and rich to ignore any longer. What park managers and staff need to determine is what role the park will play in bringing a more culturally complex appreciation of the places and resources it stewards, and what it will do to protect traditional cultural properties and permit access to them in culturally appropriate ways.

In concluding, the stories that surround many places in the Black Hills have had an uncanny tendency to reproduce themselves over time and from one group of people to another. For many different reasons, the landscapes themselves appear to play a role in evoking and shaping the way people come to understand and approach them. Certainly the tribal nations who lived in this area, and whose knowledge about it has passed down to the present, held remarkably similar understandings of the area. Although European Americans initially approached the Black Hills and its varied landscapes with very different kinds of sensibilities, they too eventually adopted approaches, which quite curiously hold traces of the ways in which tribal peoples have related to the area. For example, except for a brief time between 1880-1930 when some of the land inside the borders of WCNP was parceled out and privatized, this area of the Hills has always been a commons

Humans came to the lands of Wind Cave National Park and its surrounding areas for many different reasons and purposes, but, in the end, they have always been beholden, in one way or another, to its ultimate "owner," the bison. In tribal traditions, most of the stories about this area focus on bison. Coincidentally, European American ties to this land have returned to the bison too. It is the bison whose presence (and even absence) has given this area of the Black Hills a distinct cultural definition throughout much of its human history. It is the bison that holds the key to building a foundation of cooperation in the creation of innovative narratives about the park and in reaching consensus about the management of its sites and resources. It is the bison that can bring together the different groups who have a cultural interest in the park and its resources. These remarks are not intended to be Pollyannaish, although they certainly can be construed in this way. Their aim is to find a realistic and workable way to approach, attend to, and represent the park's interests in a manner that can incorporate the divergent and at times conflicting, interests of its various public constituencies. The park is already common ground, at least technically, but it also needs some kind of common denominator for reaching out to and drawing in the many different voices and perspectives that can reflect upon and contribute stories about its landscape, life forms, and history. In closing, and in keeping with much of the spirit in which this report is written, it is worthwhile to quote the words of a song, composed by Brave Buffalo, a Lakota from Standing Rock (in Densmore 1918:174).

Wa-hi-na-wa-pin kte.....I will appear
Wama'yanka yo.....behold me
tatan'ka wan..... a buffalo
hema' kiya.....said to me.